

APPENDIX

Musical examples

I have selected but a handful of performances from the jazz and classical fields in order to illustrate at least in part how recordings have influenced the way we hear music. Most of these recordings are old, in the public domain, or from radio broadcasts; I have tried very hard to avoid in-print, commercial recordings in order to circumvent royalty fees. I am hoping that the few examples I have used will be forgiven in the spirit of illustrating musical influences rather than my trying to make a profit from the hard-fought-over spoils of some mega-corporation.

Jazz

The cross-influences in jazz are, of course, often dependent on recordings; in lieu of an artist hearing one of their idols live, the influence of recordings have been paramount. The examples chosen display this influence in microcosm.

1. **I'm Gonna Gitcha** – Louis Armstrong and his Hot Five. Although several important early soloists had already made records by November 1925, when “Louis Armstrong and his Hot Five” first entered the OKeh recording studios, these recordings literally took the jazz world by storm. It wasn't just the power and impetuosity of Armstrong's cornet playing and singing, but the extraordinarily rhythmic looseness, what became known as “swing,” which he single-handedly invented. This early example dates from June of 1926 and features the excellent Johnny Dodds on clarinet.

Singin' the Blues. When Frank Trumbauer's studio-only band, recorded this J. Russel Robinson piece in 1927, few present at the session realized how much it would come to influence the future of jazz. In addition to the examples chosen, there was also an unissued “vocalese” performance from 1929 by the rather shrill-voiced vaudeville singer Bee Palmer.

2. **Singin' the Blues** – Frank Trumbauer and his Orchestra. The original recording. After a brief, somewhat unimaginative introduction, Frank Trumbauer plays a lithe, harmonically and rhythmically interesting solo on the C-melody sax, followed by an incredibly inventive rewriting of the original tune by Bix Beiderbecke on cornet. There is also a certain amount of invention and interplay in the ride-out chorus.
3. **Singin' the Blues** – Fletcher Henderson and his Orchestra. This 1931 orchestrated remake is a rare early example of a “tribute” recording. The original version is orchestrated, including Trumbauer's original sax solo, but cornetist Rex Stewart plays Beiderbecke's solo note for note. Stewart later claimed that this exposure to Bix's style helped formulate his solo playing aesthetic. It is also an example of the kind of “recreation” that would become fairly common by the mid-1940s.
4. **Singin' the Blues** – Marion Harris. A 1934 recording made for the British Decca label by an American singer who, early in her career, was better-known for novelty tunes with the word “jazz” in the title than for singing anything in a true jazz style. Since Bee Palmer's rather sad 1929 effort was unreleased, this is, in effect, the first issued “vocalese” recording. Note how Harris completely rewrites the opening in order to include fanciful lyrics of her own, then wraps her vocal cords adroitly around Trumbauer's and Beiderbecke's solos.

Earl Hines, fountainhead of modern jazz piano

During the 1920s, only audiences in Chicago and a handful of true jazz lovers elsewhere were even aware of Earl Hines' innovative piano style. The New Orleans style of Jelly Roll Morton and the New York "stride" of James P. Johnson and Fats Waller were much better-known. Yet Hines' way of building complex musical structures out of a few simple building blocks influenced a great many pianists, including the extraordinarily talented Art Tatum.

5. **A Monday Date** – Earl Hines. An original 1928 recording showing how the early Hines was completely reworking the direction and structure of a jazz piano solo.
6. **Who?** – Teddy Wilson with the Benny Goodman Trio. Wilson simplified the Hinesian style at about the same time that Art Tatum, another piano genius, was amplifying and extending it. But Tatum's romantic fantasias were a stylistic dead end unto himself, while Hines' style (through Wilson) worked to expand its influence.
7. **Rosetta** – Nat King Cole Trio. An example of how Nat Cole, a more modern descendant of Hines', also reduced the Hines style to essentials yet retained some of the more complex harmonic structures. It should also be noted that Hines, Tatum and Cole were also strong influences on such modern pianists as Bud Powell, Lennie Tristano and Bill Evans.

Saxophone and Trumpet influences

8. **Blue Lester** – Lester Young with Count Basie, piano. In the midst of "hot" Kansas City swing music strode the laid-back, cool, ethereal tenor saxophone of Lester "Prez" Young. It is one of the great ironies of jazz that Young, a black man, primarily influenced white musicians, and his influence continued well beyond 1959, when he died, via the medium of recordings. The hot and heavy styles of Coleman Hawkins and Chu Berry, once thought so innovative and so influential, have since evolved into a more complex style via John Coltrane who influenced everyone else who Young didn't – again, largely through recordings.
9. **Diggin' Diz** – Dizzy Gillespie Jazzmen, featuring Charlie Parker, alto sax. Gillespie was the first trumpet player to conceive a sense of rhythm different from Armstrong's, while Parker virtually invented the lexicon of modern jazz phrases. In his hands, they were fresh and always inventive, but as time went on other altoists, studying his records intently, ended up copying his little phrases and connecting passages, which jazz musicians call "turnarounds," note-for-note. On this disc we also hear tenor saxist Lucky Thompson, who clearly shows the Lester Young influence.
10. **Down Under** – Art Blakey and the Jazz Messengers. For more than thirty years, drummer Art Blakey's Jazz Messengers presented the best in contemporary jazz for worldwide consumption. He was particularly admired for his ability to discover outstanding young trumpeters, from Clifford Brown and Lee Morgan to Wynton Marsalis. Freddie Hubbard, one of the greatest of all jazz innovators, is the trumpeter in this particular band, but of equal importance is the tenor sax of Wayne Shorter. Shorter's angular, harmonically daring solos were an alternative to the even more convoluted style of Coltrane and, in a way, he has had an even more lasting impact on contemporary saxophonists.

Classical

Unlike jazz, where influences are linear and evolve from generation to generation, classical influences are circular and timeless. A performance recorded in, say, 1910 or 1935, if still considered valid in some or all respects, can still influence performances given in the present

day. The *written* aspects of a score must always be balanced by the *verbal* tradition that a composer has passed down to his disciples and their disciples. The literalist who believes that what is on paper is a composer's final thoughts on a composition may be, and have been, surprised to hear a composer's own interpretation on a record that modifies or contradicts what is on paper. Thus we can never consider a written score to be more than a guideline to what was really going through the composer's mind when a piece was written.

Perhaps the most startling and concrete example of this is to listen to Béla Bartók's own performances of his music. Whereas the written scores suggest an angular, almost jagged musical line, the composer himself played with a fluidity and elegant grace that belied the notes on paper. But of course there are other examples of brilliant interpreters who have influenced modern performances of older music, despite anachronistic elements in their playing or singing, as well as performances that influenced modern ones simply because they *sounded* so beautiful on discs.

11. **Bach Concerto No. 2, Finale** – Bronislaw Huberman. Despite being performed with the fairly lush-sounding string section of the Vienna Philharmonic Orchestra, Huberman's Bach, considered quirky and unidiomatic in its day, had three features to it that have greatly influenced modern performances. These were the rather "straight" tone that he used, at a time when virtually all violinists were pursuing the "full vibrato" sound exemplified by Fritz Kreisler and the Auer pupils (Elman, Heifetz, Seidl, Zimbalist); the uncanny verve of his crisp bowing and sharp spiccato attacks; and the way the violin "emerged" from the massed strings as soloist, then reverted back into the string section when he was not soloing.
12. **Bach Concerto No. 2, Finale** – Sigiswald Kuijken, La Petite Bande. A modern performance of the same music, at a slightly faster tempo and without the portamento effects that Huberman used, which exemplifies his influence.
13. **Puccini: La Bohème, Che gelida manina** – Beniamino Gigli. Gigli, often considered the successor to Caruso, was in fact a very different kind of tenor. His success was predicated not so much on an outpouring of a rich, golden tone as it was on the brightness of his sound and the uncanny way he could manage to "smile" while singing. On the other hand, his mannerisms, which included breaking the legato line for sobs and chuckles of no apparent relativity to the material, were something that other tenors avoided.
14. **Puccini: La Bohème, Che gelida manina** – Luciano Pavarotti. Pavarotti, the only tenor of the modern era to rival such stars as Caruso and Gigli for his universality of popularity, also did so through personality rather than a golden tone. Indeed, his voice was smaller, and drier, than Gigli's, but he too managed to learn to "smile" with the voice, and his effervescent personality helped carry him through a 40-year career. Just as Gigli's "Che gelida" influenced him (as well as the Swedish tenor Nicolai Gedda), so too has Pavarotti's singing helped to influence the Swiss tenor Roberto Alagna, who has publicly admitted his admiration for the older tenor.
15. **Berlioz: Symphonie Fantastique, V. Song of the Witches' Sabbath** – Pierre Monteux conducting the Orchestre Symphonique de Paris. Monteux's 1930 "Symphonie Fantastique," widely hailed in its day but then forgotten, tightened up the tempi of the outer movements up a notch from the metronome markings in Berlioz' score, yet Monteux insisted that he learned them (as well as the sharply defined, almost X-ray clarity he achieves here) from Edouard Colonne, who had known Berlioz during the composer's later years and insisted that this was how he conducted his own score. Here, then, we

have an example of the verbal tradition being passed down to a younger man, who in turn managed to get his account preserved on record.

16. **Berlioz: Symphonie Fantastique, V. Song of the Witches' Sabbath** – Charles Munch conducting the Boston Symphony Orchestra. Thirty-two years after Monteux recorded his classic account of the score, Charles Munch, who had studied it closely and gleaned further information from Monteux as to the way Berlioz himself conducted it, led a quite similar performance; but by this time Monteux's recording, never reissued even on LP, was a distant memory, and many critics took Munch to task for "speeding up" the symphony. Nevertheless Munch's account, which luckily was preserved in stereo sound rather than the cramped sonics of the old carbon microphones, influenced a great many listeners and made them re-evaluate more "proper" performances of the work.
17. **Haydn: Symphony No. 31, "Hornsignal," III: Menuet** – NBC Symphony Orchestra, conducted by Arturo Toscanini. Toscanini's rapid, one-beat-to-the-bar tempi for Haydn and Mozart minuets were considered heretical in their day, but had an enormous impact on modern historically-informed performances when researchers discovered that this was, indeed, the way they were probably played in the late 18th century. On the other hand, Toscanini's penchant for extreme clarity within each orchestral section, exciting and stimulating in live performance, grated on the ears of many home record listeners. This is one aspect of his style that has not survived in modern performances.
18. **Cherubini: Medea, Creonte a me solo** – Maria Callas. For a century and a half, Cherubini's operatic masterpiece was virtually ignored, and for good reason. No soprano could break the sulphuric character of Medea out of the strict formality of Cherubini's score. But Callas found a way and, for better or worse, her interpretation has remained so definitive that few sopranos have dared to recreate it since. Luckily there remain on disc at least four performances by Callas, this commercial recording and at least three "live" performances, two of them with the great singing-actor Jon Vickers as Giasone.
19. **Sibelius: Valse triste** – Leopold Stokowski and his Symphony Orchestra. Stokowski the sound freak, with his overlush, almost decadent-sounding string sections, had a powerful affect on both the sound of orchestras in our time and the way orchestras were recorded in the studio. This 1948 recording belies its age with a string sound that practically leaps off the grooves of the old record.
20. **Sibelius: Valse triste** – Herbert von Karajan conducting the Berlin Philharmonic Orchestra. Karajan was an odd mixture of Toscanini and Stokowski, with a little bit of Wilhelm Furtwängler's slow tempi thrown in now and then. In Sibelius he, like Stokowski, opted for a far lusher string sound than the Finnish composer really called for. Unlike Stokowski, he was good enough of a musician to avoid the glitzy rendition given by the older man and plunge a bit deeper into the "dark side" of this melancholy piece.
21. **Purcell: Musick for a while** – Russell Oberlin. Oberlin's beautiful, haunting counter-tenor voice was a hallmark of 1950s performances by the New York Pro Musica and his own solo performances until 1964. When he recorded this song in the 1950s, very few classical music aficionados and record-buyers were familiar with it; after they heard him sing it, they could not forget it.
22. **Purcell: Musick for a while** – Emma Kirkby with Fretwork. This performance from 2005 by a soprano who clearly has listened to Oberlin, among others, shows that a good tradition is not to be passed up; and who knows how many future listeners will be influenced by her performance without even knowing of Oberlin's existence.